Evaluating Career and Professional Development: Connecting Students, Faculty and Institutional Needs and Outcomes

Judith Stoddart, Ph.D., Associate Dean
Henry (Rique) Campa, III, Ph.D., Associate Dean

CGS 2014
What are the most important goals for your career and professional development programs?

A. Improve completion rates
B. Improve placement outcomes
C. Improve job satisfaction
D. Provide networking opportunities for your students
E. Change campus culture
F. Other

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
What are the biggest challenges in developing and improving your career and professional development programs?

A. Student participation
B. Buy in from faculty
C. Limited resources
D. Don’t know what is effective
E. Don’t know student needs
F. Other
Debra Stewart, “Professional Development for Graduate Students: Reflections on the Demands, the Resources, and the Skills”

“For more than a decade graduate students have been telling us that . . . graduate schools should make available professional development opportunities for careers both inside and outside of academe. . . . we are also increasingly hearing that graduate schools are under considerable stress to reduce “nonessential” activities in their offices. Juxtaposing these two realities leads me this year to think through the question of whether or not professional development, beyond core preparation in the discipline, is a wise expenditure of resources in times when all of our graduate schools are being asked to do more with less.”
Demands

- reframe: Needs
- question: What are the essential needs? Who defines them?
- activity: Assess

Resources

- reframe: Interventions (people, money, time)
- question: Do the interventions meet the needs?
- activity: Define measurable goals and objectives

Skills

- reframe: Student and faculty behaviors and knowledge
- question: How do we know if we have met the needs?
- activity: Measure and evaluate outcomes
Connecting the dots . . .

1. Assess Needs
2. Define goals and objectives
3. Design interventions
4. Measure outcomes
Agenda and Goals

1. Describe a process for career and professional development program and workshop planning and assessment
2. Test assumptions with data
3. Use data for evaluating programs and planning workshops

Goals

1. Provide examples of planning and assessment tools
2. Reflect on underlying assumptions about needs
Assessing the needs: Data

Professional Socialization for the PhD: An Exploration of Career and Professional Development Preparedness and Readiness for PhD Candidates

Students surveyed from 119 programs in 2006; 668 responded

- Career goals of graduate students **change** over time:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Enrolled 1-2 yrs vs. Enrolled &gt;3 yrs</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very interested in career research in an academic setting</td>
<td></td>
<td>P = 0.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very interested in career teaching at a research university</td>
<td></td>
<td>P = 0.026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not interested at all or Somewhat interested in careers working in govt.</td>
<td></td>
<td>P = 0.039</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Helm, Campa, Moretto, 2012)
Skill preparation for careers inside and outside the academy was inadequate for many students:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of skills (e.g.)</th>
<th>% of respondents IMPORTANCE</th>
<th>% of respondents PREPARATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do independent research</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publish and present research</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead a research project</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborate in teams</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach a large lecture</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach a lab</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Helm, Campa, Moretto, 2012)
What the Research Tells Us:

The Scholarship of PREP

• ~75% of Ph.D.s will work in environments where other competencies are more important than research.

• ~50% of doctoral recipients will find employment as tenure track faculty in a college or university. Most will be in an institution that focuses on teaching rather than research.

• Students complete doctoral degrees without understanding the missions, faculty roles and rewards, and academic culture of various institutions (e.g., Austin et al. 2007)

• Studies of doctoral education and early career faculty show that students need information about career choices, teaching, mentoring (e.g., Nyquist et al. 2001, Weidman et al. 2001)
MSU Career and Professional Development Programs
(Planning, Resilience, Engagement, Professionalism)

PREP Goals

• Broaden awareness of professional expectations in graduate education
• Prepare students to plan and manage their own careers
• Promote graduate student retention and completion
• Provide students with a competitive edge in securing professional positions
## PREP Matrix

Use the PREP Matrix to plan a successful graduate school experience and your career. Click on a topic area to see a list of resources, assessments, and events. If you have a user account, you can save selected items to your personalized PREP list.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planning</th>
<th>Resilience</th>
<th>Engagement</th>
<th>Professionalism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Early</strong></td>
<td><strong>Financial planning</strong></td>
<td><strong>Choosing an advisor</strong></td>
<td><strong>Developing teaching skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Setting expectations</strong></td>
<td><strong>Building professional networks</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Identifying career goals</strong></td>
<td><strong>Identifying transferable skills</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Creating a wellness plan</strong></td>
<td><strong>Developing support systems</strong></td>
<td><strong>Research ethics training</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Developing support systems</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>ESL resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mid</strong></td>
<td><strong>Preparing for the job search or postdoc</strong></td>
<td><strong>Sustaining support systems</strong></td>
<td><strong>Planning your portfolio</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Preparing for comprehensive exams</strong></td>
<td><strong>Conflict resolution</strong></td>
<td><strong>Using your teaching skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Funding your research</strong></td>
<td><strong>Managing stress</strong></td>
<td><strong>Conducting ethical research</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Approaching dissertation research</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Late</strong></td>
<td><strong>Writing the dissertation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Surviving the dissertation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Publishing your work</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Financial planning for the early career</strong></td>
<td><strong>Managing professional transitions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Creating your portfolio</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Securing academic positions and postdocs</strong></td>
<td><strong>Working professional networks</strong></td>
<td><strong>Defending and submitting the dissertation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Securing non-academic positions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Negotiating the job offer</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Employing transferable skills in your new career</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### My PREP Account

- **My Resources**
- **My Plans**

### Upcoming Events

- **RCR: Record Keeping, Data Management, and Sharing of Information**
  11/19/2014 - 06:00 pm to 07:30 pm
- **Fine-Tuning Your Accent II**
  11/20/2014 - 05:30 pm to 07:00 pm

View [Upcoming Events Listing](#)

### Recently Added Resources

- **Behavior Based Interviews (State of Michigan)**
  Videos and handouts describing the behavior based method of interviewing, designed for...
PREP Professional Themes

- Planning
- Resilience
- Engagement
- Professionalism

Transferable Skills

- Communication
- Job Search Strategies
- Balance and Resilience
- Collaboration
- Leadership
- Research, Scholarship, & Creative Activity
- Ethics and Integrity

How to: Affiliated Partners

- Office of Career Services
- AGEP Grant
- NSF I-cubed Grant
- Local colleges and universities

- Writing Center
- Olin Health Center
- The Counseling Center
- Employee Assistance Program

- CIRTL NSF Grant
- COGS/Grad. Student Org.
- Grad Employees Union
- University Outreach & Engagement

- Vice President for Research
- Teaching Assistant Program
- Faculty Development Office
- PFF Grant-ASL Grant

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
First-year graduate student survey

-M.S. and Ph.D. graduate students

-Surveyed – 2nd Semester (1st year) at MSU in 2007 & 2009; 2009 data reported

-158 domestic, 127 international students responded

-students responded across 12 colleges

Reflect: What are the implications of these data for student career and professional development or mentoring?

(Nunez, unpublished)
First-year graduate student survey: early plans

2009

(Nunez, unpublished)
First-year graduate student survey: planning

I have started developing a career plan that will take me from graduate school to my first job

2009

(Nunez, unpublished)
First-year graduate student survey: awareness

2009

(Nunez, unpublished)
Program level development and evaluation

Assess Needs
- Looked at research
- Conducted surveys

Define goals and objectives
- Prepare students to plan and manage their careers

Design interventions
- Created PREP planning tool
- Incorporated PREP into orientation and early workshops

Measure outcomes
- Assess first-year student planning

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
Workshop evaluation: cognitive objectives

**PREP Program Goal:** Broaden awareness of professional expectations in graduate education

**Workshop Cognitive Objective:** Students will better understand professional expectations at a variety of academic institutions

*What can measuring outcomes tell us about meeting objectives AND assessing future needs?*
Free Workshop for Graduate Students!

Securing Academic Positions at Two- and Four-Year Institutions
(Sponsored by The Graduate School, Michigan State University)

October 30, 2004
9:00 AM - 4:00 PM (Lunch is Included)
The Kellogg Center, Big Ten C Room, Michigan State University Campus

Featured Presenters: Dr. Carol Hurlburt (Chair, Science Department, Lansing Community College), Dr. Karen Klomparens (Dean, The Graduate School, Michigan State University), Dr. Michael Stob (Director of Assessment, Calvin College), Dr. Bill Wiener (Dean, The Graduate College, Western Michigan University)

What type of academic position would you like to have after completing your degree? Do you want to teach, do research, develop and conduct outreach programs, or a little of each? What kinds of institutions best fit your interests? What are the expectations for applications at different kinds of institutions, and what are the potential career trajectories?

9:00....................Welcome and Introductions (Big Ten C) – Dr. Rique Campa and Dr. Judith Stoddart
9:15-11:45.............Feature presenters presentations and discussions with participants
Noon-1:00..............Lunch (Red Cedar AB)
1:15-4:00 PM..........Breakout Sessions (choose 1 of Session A, B or C)

Breakout Sessions
The three breakout sessions will run concurrently. Student should choose one session.

Session A, Humanities Positions and Interviews (Willy Room) Dr. Judith Stoddart (moderator)
Session B, Social Science Positions and Interviews (Room 101) Dr. Tony Nunez (moderator)
Session C, Natural Sciences Positions and Interviews (Heritage Room) Dr. Rique Campa (moderator)
2004 Post-workshop evaluation question (110 attended):

“Do you feel you walked away with practical skills related to securing an academic positions? If so, what are they?”

“Yes” 80%
“No” 1%
“Somewhat” 4%
No response 15%

Comments (e.g.):
“I learned how to prepare for the types of interview questions that I might encounter. I learned strategies for dealing with inappropriate questions. I saw the importance of providing personal examples.”

“Yes, how to communicate and handle yourself through the interviewing process. Also what things should be included in the application.”

Interesting qualitative data, but doesn’t address the objective
New evaluation question 2005-14

**Workshop Cognitive Objective**: Students will better understand professional expectations at a variety of academic institutions

“I understand the institutional expectations for a tenured and untenured faculty member at different kinds of institutions”

Pre AND Post workshop evaluations
I understand the institutional expectations for a tenured and untenured faculty member at different kinds of institutions.
Breaking down the numbers by cohort

I understand the institutional expectations for a tenured and untenured faculty member at different kinds of institutions

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
Pre-workshop understanding 2005-2014

I understand the institutional expectations for a tenured and untenured faculty member at different kinds of institutions.

Percent

Year


Cohort
1-2y, Agree
3-4y, Agree
5+y, Agree

Agree
I understand the professional norms in my discipline: first-year doctoral students

A. Strongly disagree/disagree
B. Neutral
C. Strongly agree/agree
First-year graduate student survey

2009

(Nunez, unpublished)
Workshop evaluation: behavioral objectives

**PREP Program Goal:** Broaden awareness of professional expectations in graduate education

**Behavioral objective:** Increase discussions between graduate students and their advisors about expectations for early career faculty

**Pre-workshop question:** “I talk to my advisor about the promotion and tenure process at academic institutions”
Early results: 2007

I talk to my advisor about expectations for promotion and tenure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CANR</th>
<th>CAL</th>
<th>CAS</th>
<th>CED</th>
<th>EGR</th>
<th>CNS</th>
<th>SSC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>never/seldom</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>76.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>always/often</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Response:

- Took these data out to the colleges and grad program directors
- Added 2 faculty p&t panels to the academic institutions workshop
- Added several workshops on faculty life (e.g., work/life balance, promotion and tenure, mentoring of faculty, two-career couples)
Partners for Professional Development & Mentoring

35 full-day or evening workshops from Sept 2004 to December 2014

130 Individual Partners Assisted with 35 workshops

- University Administrators
  29 individuals
  (9 different inst.)

- Outside academia
  15 individuals
  (NGOs, agencies, industry)

- Doctoral Students & Post-docs
  10 individuals

- Faculty
  57 individuals
  (26 depts.
   11 different inst.)

- University Administrators/Faculty
  4 individuals

- University Staff
  15 individuals

Interaction Among Partners
Drilling down in the demographics

Reassess and look at our data differently 2005-2014

Research on gender and communication, gender in mentoring relationships, gender and negotiation

Are there differences in how frequently male and female students report talking with their advisor about academic expectations?
I talk to my advisor about the promotion and tenure process at academic institutions

Female respondents

A. Never
B. Seldom
C. Frequently
I talk to my advisor about the promotion and tenure process at academic institutions

Male respondents

A. Never
B. Seldom
C. Frequently

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
I talk to my advisor about the promotion and tenure process at academic institutions.
Comparing responses by gender

I talk to my advisor about the promotion and tenure process at academic institutions, 2005-2014

Stoddart & Campa CGS 2014
Breaking down gender responses by college

College: Agriculture & Natural Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male, n=31</th>
<th>Female, n=34</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequently</td>
<td>32.26%</td>
<td>26.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>41.94%</td>
<td>35.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>25.81%</td>
<td>38.24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

College: Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male, n=35</th>
<th>Female, n=51</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequently</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
<td>25.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>37.14%</td>
<td>45.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>48.57%</td>
<td>29.41%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

College: Engineering

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male, n=31</th>
<th>Female, n=13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequently</td>
<td>64.52%</td>
<td>15.36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>23.08%</td>
<td>29.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>61.54%</td>
<td>55.61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Talk to my advisor: academic vs. non-academic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I talk to my advisor about expectations in academic positions (2005-2014)</th>
<th>I talk to my advisor about expectations in non-academic positions (2006-2010)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequently academic</td>
<td>Frequently non-academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1(^{st}) yr</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2(^{nd}) yr</td>
<td>25.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3(^{rd}) yr</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4(^{th}) yr</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5(^{th}) yr</td>
<td>27.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6+ yrs</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXPLORE professional development resources
ASSESS your professional skills
CREATE your career and professional development plan
USE professional development tools
BUILD professional portfolios

Visit Career Success @ careersuccess.msu.edu

Welcome to Michigan State University Career Success

Choose your role above for a customized introduction to this site.

Welcome to MSU Career Success, your gateway to resources, programs, events and planning tools for graduate students, postdocs and faculty mentors. With a free account, you can customize your career planning, save resources, develop annual individual development plans, and create professional portfolios that document your skills.
Career and Professional Development Resources & Evaluating Outcomes

- Assumptions?
- Re-evaluation of Your Outcomes

Measure and Evaluate Outcomes

- C/P Development Integrated Program (Pre-/Post-)?
- Web Resources & Analytics?

Workshops (Pre- /Post-)?

Workshops/Interventions?

Time

Building Capacity Over Time!
Reflection

What do you want to learn about your campus?

What do you want to learn about your programs?

Are you asking the questions that will give you the answers you need?

What will you do based on those answers? How will they help you target change?
Questions?

Contacts:

Judith Stoddart, stoddart@msu.edu

Henry (Rique) Campa, campa@msu.edu